

**Organ Shortage in Transplantation Medicine:
Whose values and on what basis
should organ procurement be organised?**

Berichte aus der Medizin

Christel Naujoks

**Organ Shortage in Transplantation Medicine:
Whose values and on what basis
should organ procurement be organised?**

Shaker Verlag
Aachen 2007

Bibliographic information published by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available in the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>.

Copyright Shaker Verlag 2007

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the publishers.

Printed in Germany.

ISBN 978-3-8322-6523-6

ISSN 0945-0890

Shaker Verlag GmbH • P.O. BOX 101818 • D-52018 Aachen

Phone: 0049/2407/9596-0 • Telefax: 0049/2407/9596-9

Internet: www.shaker.de • e-mail: info@shaker.de

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am grateful to Prof. Gavin Mooney, my supervisor, who generously supported me working on this challenging topic. This master thesis marks the finish line of three exciting long-distance course years in Health Economics at Curtin University, Perth, Western Australia. I'm happy that I could benefit from modern ways of training and that I once met with Gavin Mooney and Val Reid who provided great assistance during the course years.

I thank Dr. Steve Takemoto who after this thesis has been accepted by Curtin University provided valuable suggestions to improve language for this publication.

Christel Naujoks

July 2007

CONTENTS

	PAGE
1. Introduction	1
1.1 Growth of transplantation as a clinical discipline	1
1.2 Organ donation	2
1.3 Consent policies	2
1.4 Outline	4
2. Deceased organ donation	7
2.1 Deceased organ donation based on altruism	7
2.1.1 Origin of altruism	7
2.1.2 SEN's two forms of altruism: sympathy and commitment	8
2.1.3 MARGOLIS' participation altruism	12
2.1.4 Deceased organ donation attitudes among the public: Empirical evidence	14
2.1.5 Increasing waiting lists as a result of constant low altruistic donation	20
2.2 Deceased organ donation based on altruism and financial incentives	22
2.2.1 TITMUSS' <i>Gift Relationship</i> and Kantian duty	22
2.2.2 AMITAI ETZIONI and duty	28
2.2.3 Public attitudes regarding financial incentives for deceased organ donation	31
2.3 Deceased organ donation based on reciprocity	35
3. Living organ donation	40
3.1 Living organ donation based on altruism	40
3.2 Living organ donation based on financial incentives	43
3.2.1 The market of living human organs	45
3.2.2 Public attitudes regarding financial incentives for living organ donation	48

	PAGE
4. The need for public participation when deciding for an organ procurement approach	50
4.1 From individual values to the notion of community	50
4.2 Role of community values	51
4.2.1 Revisiting community participation	59
4.2.2 Citizens' Juries – An approach to informed, deliberated public consultation	60
4.3 Notion of social responsibility in communitarianism	62
5. Conclusion	65
6. Bibliography	71

TABLES

TABLE 1	Deceased organ donation attitudes among the public: Results form international survey studies	16
TABLE 2	Legislative organ procurement policies in different countries	19
TABLE 3	International surveys to investigate public attitudes towards financial incentives for deceased organ donation	31
TABLE 4	International surveys to investigate living organ donation attitudes among the public	42
TABLE 5	International surveys to investigate public attitudes towards financial incentives for living organ donation	49
TABLE 6	International surveys to investigate public attitudes towards organ allocation criteria	55

FIGURES

FIGURE 1	Monetary incentives and economic analysis	47
-----------------	---	----